



Submission to the Tshwane Municipality's Draft 2023/24 Budget
Date: 17 May 2023

Submitted by: Planact, 1to1 Agency of Engagement, Tshwane Leadership Foundation and International Budget Partnership South Africa as part of the Asivikelane Campaign¹ representing informal settlements communities in Tshwane Municipality.

Contact details: Mike Makwela, Mike@planact.org.za, 07699226054

This submission is based on residents' reflections and comments on the City of Tshwane's draft 2023/24 Budget and Integrated Development Plan (IDP). The submission includes recommendations, a brief analysis of the City's draft budget and IDP, as well as evidence from informal settlement residents to ensure that the City is responsive to the needs of its people.

1. Recommendations

1.1 The City must allocate more money for the provision of water tanks and tankers in informal settlements. We appreciate that the City provides budget allocations for water tankers in informal settlements. However, the budget allocation has decreased from 2022/23, and we call on the City to increase this allocation to ensure settlements have access to enough water.

1.2 The City must increase the budget allocation for chemical toilets in informal settlements. This will ensure the consistent servicing of existing toilets and the provision of new toilets where necessary. Several settlements have serious sanitation challenges, yet the City's budget allocation for chemical toilets remains unchanged.

1.3 The City must make specific budget allocations for the provision of solid waste management in informal settlements. This will help cultivate an environment of innovation around waste management solutions for informal settlements. The Metro should prioritise

¹ www.asivikelane.org

refuse collection in informal settlements as it impacts residents' health, dignity, and their environment. The increased budget allocation for waste skips is encouraging, however, there is no indication how much of this budget will benefit informal settlement residents. Furthermore, the budget allocation for contracted services for environment and agriculture management has decreased, and it is unclear how this will impact the budget for the contracted services that provide waste management.

1.4 The City should increase the budget for the “Electricity for All” programme.

Residents are disappointed with the decrease in the City's budget allocation for public lighting. We feel that this impacts on the safety of residents, in particular women and children, when they have to access communal taps and toilets. We also ask that the final budget includes information on which informal settlements will receive public lighting and the type of service (e.g., high mast lights or street lighting).

1.5 The City must ringfence a budget allocation for the repairs and maintenance of taps and toilets in informal settlements. It is a major concern that the City's draft repairs and maintenance budget for 2023/24 has decreased from the adopted 2022/23 budget. The City does not specify how much has been set aside for the repairs and maintenance of informal settlement water and sanitation infrastructure and it is unclear how the overall budget cut will impact repairs and maintenance in informal settlements. What is also worrisome is that the City's share of its repairs and maintenance budget as a percentage of the value of its Property, Plant and Equipment (PPE) is not in line with the National Treasury guideline of 8%. We would like more money to be allocated to repairs and maintenance in informal settlements as many taps and toilets have issues that are not being attended to. This results in communities not having access to water and sanitation, even in areas that already have these services installed.

1.6 The City must provide a budget breakdown for, and more detail on the informal settlement upgrading projects in the draft budget for the coming financial year. The budget does not show which informal settlements will benefit from the overall upgrading budget and when they can expect upgrading work to start. We welcome the minimal increase in the allocation for upgrading but question whether this increase is big enough to fund the City's plans to upgrade informal settlements over the next three years.

2. Asivikelane Campaign and service delivery challenges experienced by Tshwane residents

The Asivikelane campaign aims to give a voice to informal settlement residents who face severe basic services shortages in South Africa's major cities. Asivikelane regularly supports informal settlement communities to monitor water, sanitation and refuse collection and to use this data to engage metros about these services.

Evidence collected between January and March 2023 shows that residents living in informal settlements face several service delivery challenges. Residents have also identified what they would like the City to allocate more money for in its 2023/24 budget. This section

summarises residents' requests and provides supporting evidence from the most recent Asivikelane surveys of the challenges faced by residents.

2.1 Insufficient water supply to informal settlements

In March, almost a 100% of residents said they want to see more money in the budget for water. Almost 40% of residents said that they specifically wanted more money to provide taps because they don't have any in their settlements, while 50% of residents who rely on water tanks wanted more money to provide additional tanks.

In February, 50% of informal settlement residents said that they did not have access to enough water in the previous seven days. Some residents specifically said that they did not have enough taps, while others said that water tanks were not filled up due to the heavy rains during that month.

2.2 Inadequate access to sanitation

More than 90% of the Metro's residents want to see more money in the budget for sanitation. A total of 46% of residents said they want the City to specifically allocate more money for sanitation because they do not have enough toilets in their settlement, while almost 50% said they want to see more money in the budget for regular cleaning of toilets and desludging of chemical toilets. In February, 37% of residents said their toilets were not cleaned in the previous week.

2.3 Lack of access to waste removal services

Residents have raised waste collection as a major challenge which impacts their quality of life, health and environment. In March, almost 100% of residents living in 16 informal settlements in Tshwane said they wanted to see more money in the budget for regular waste removal. At least 50% said more money is needed to provide refuse removal services because they don't receive any, while the remaining 50% said that money needs to be allocated to increase the frequency of the service they receive.

Residents who do receive the service also said they want to see more money in the budget for refuse bags, and a further 45% want more money set aside for bins and or skips to dispose of their refuse.

Evidence collected in February confirms the dire state of refuse removal, with 61% of residents saying that their refuse was not removed in the previous week. These residents included both residents who live in settlements with no access to refuse removal, as well as residents who do receive a service, but don't receive it regularly.

2.4 Inadequate repairs and maintenance

In March 2023, close to 90% of residents said they wanted more money allocated to fix their broken taps, toilets, and water tanks. The lack of maintenance and repairs is a major

challenge in the Metro’s informal settlements, with residents continuously reporting that their taps, toilets or water tanks are not fixed when they break.

In February 2023, only 34% of residents said repairs were completed within a week of the fault being reported. One of the biggest challenges facing close to 60% of residents was broken water tanks which at least half of the residents rely on for their access to water.

3. What the evidence from the 2023/24 draft budget telling us?

Based on the service delivery issues highlighted by the Asivikelane campaign, we have focused our analysis on the City’s budget allocations for water, sanitation, electricity, refuse removal and informal settlement upgrading.

3.1 Budget allocations for water

The City wants to ensure that by the end of 2023/24, 77,25% of households in Tshwane have access to a basic level of water. It intends to increase this target only marginally to 78% in 2026/27, which will still leave a significant backlog in access to water.

The City provides water tankers as an interim solution to informal settlements without access to taps. It refers to these tankers as “rudimentary services”. While the provision of rudimentary services is the responsibility of the Human Settlements Department, there is an additional allocation for the provision of water tankers in the budget of the Water and Sanitation Department.

In both departments, the allocation for water tankers increased in the adjusted 2022/23 budget from the original allocations in the adopted budget. However, both budgets have declined significantly in the draft 2023/24 budget, with the overall budget for water tankers 30% less than in 2022/23. The Metro doesn’t specify how many tankers will be provided in the coming year, or which settlements will receive water from this source. *See Table 1*

Table 1: Budget allocation for water tankers

R'000	2022/23 Adopted Budget	2022/23 Adjusted Budget	2023/24 Draft Budget	% change between adjusted 2022/23 and draft 2023/24 budget
Water Tankers- Rudimentary services (Human Settlements)	291 700	315 700	222 300	-29,59%
Water Tankers - settlements(Water and sanitation)	49 000	75 000	51 100	-31,87
Total budget for water tankers	340 700	390 700	273 400	-30,02%

Source: MTREF 2023/24 page 28, MTREF 2022/23; Adjusted 2022/23 page 11

The Human Settlements Department’s capital budget funds a number of projects which will improve access to water in Tshwane. The project names include area names and “Water provision”, and the project descriptions include references to “water infrastructure” and/or “water reticulation to stands”. But it is unclear if informal settlement households will

receive taps on serviced stands as part of these projects or just receive connecting or bulk infrastructure, with residents responsible for providing their own taps.

3.2 Budget allocation for sanitation

The Metro’s draft 2023/2024 IDP scorecard has set a target for 2023/24 of ensuring that 64,25% of households in the metro have access to basic sanitation by the end of the financial year. This is only a 0,25% increase from the current baseline of 64%. The target increases marginally over the next five years to 65% of households by 2026/27. However, this means that 35% of households will still be without access to basic sanitation.

Chemical toilets

The table below shows that the City’s budget for the provision of chemical toilets has decreased by almost 10% from R37 million in 2022/23, to R33,8 million in the draft 2023/24 budget. See Table 2.

Table 2: Budget allocation for chemical toilets

R'000	2022/23 adopted	2023/24 draft	% change
Chemical toilets	37 500	33 800	-9,87%

Source: MTREF 2022/23, 2023/24 Draft Budget page 27

The Human Settlements capital budget also funds several projects which includes an area name and “Sewer provision” in the project name, and references to “sewer infrastructure” and/or “sewer reticulation to stands” in the project description. These projects are expected to increase access to sanitation, however, it is unclear from the names of the areas, as well as from the project description, which of these areas are or include informal settlements. It is also unclear if the additional spending on sanitation infrastructure will include the delivery of flush toilets on serviced stands, as well as ensure access to sanitation for disabled/wheelchair-bound members of the communities.

The City’s budget does not include any standalone project for the provision of flush toilets to informal settlements. Without a dedicated budget for flush toilets and a significant increase in this budget, it is unclear how the City plans to decrease its sanitation backlog. It is also not clear if the City considers the provision of chemical toilets (a rudimentary service) as a contribution to the planned decrease in the sanitation backlog.

3.3 Budget allocations for refuse removal

We welcome the City’s stated objective of providing all households in the City with basic refuse removal services. While this suggests that it wants to eliminate any sanitation backlog, it should be noted that 50% of the Tshwane informal settlement residents that currently participate in Asivikelane have indicated that they do not receive a refuse removal service. We, therefore, question if the City has allocated enough money to fund its ambitious target.

It should also be noted that the City does not have a separate budget allocation for refuse removal in informal settlements, making it difficult to see how it plans to address the refuse removal backlog specifically in these settlements.

The capital budget includes an item for the provision of waste containers. This allocation has substantially increased by 250% from 2022/23. However, the budget does not show where these skips will be provided, which means we cannot see if and how the bigger budget will improve refuse removal in informal settlements. See Table 3.

Table 1: Budget allocation for waste containers

R'000	2022/23 Adopted Budget	Adjusted Budget 2022/23	2023/24 Draft	% change between Adjusted and Draft
Waste containers	5 000	5 000	17 500	250%

Source: Annexure A - 2023/24 Draft Capital Budget page 53; 2022/23 Adjusted Capital Budget page 141

In the City, refuse is collected by external service providers, using their own refuse collection trucks. These providers are appointed from the Contracted Services budget of the Department of Environment and Agriculture Management. The budget has decreased substantially by 25,8%. The City does not provide a breakdown of the different contracted services in the Department funded from this budget, so it is unclear if the decrease will have a negative impact on refuse removal in the City, specifically in informal settlements. See Table 4.

Table 2: Budget allocated for waste services

R'000	Adopted Budget 2022/23	Adjusted Budget 2022/23	Draft 2023/24 Budget	% change between Adjusted and Draft
Environment and Agriculture Management				
Contracted services	798 503	833 503	618 420	-25,80%

Source: 2023/24 Draft Budget Document page 140; 2022/23 Adjusted Budget page 78

3.4 Budget allocations for electrification

Informal settlement residents often raise the challenges associated with the lack of public lighting and electrification in their settlements.

The City itself says that it wants to ensure that 94% of all households have access to electricity by the end of 2023/24. This target increases to 95,5% in 2026/27, which will leave a relatively small backlog in comparison to other basic services.

However, the budget allocation for the provision of electricity through the “Electricity for All” project has decreased by 38%, which does not signal a commitment to addressing the electricity backlog generally in the City, and specifically in informal settlements.

The capital budget also includes a project called “Tshwane Public Lighting Programme”. It is unclear if this project also provides public lighting to informal settlements. The budget has decreased by 8% from the 2022/23 adjusted budget. We urge the City to indicate if and how this project will benefit residents in informal settlements, as lack of public lighting has a major impact on residents’ safety and access to communal basic services. See *Table 5*.

Table 3: Budget allocation for electricity

R'000	Adopted Budget 2022/23	Adjusted Budget. 2022/23	Draft 2023/24	% change between adopted and 2023/24
Electricity for All	137 000	215 215	133 000	-38,20%
Tshwane Public Lighting Programme	13 000	24 000	22 000	-8,33%

Source: Annexure A - 2023/24 Draft Capital Budget pages 56, 57; 2022/23 Adjusted Capital Budget pages 145, 146

3.5 Repairs and maintenance in informal settlements

The evidence from Asiviklane has shown that both reactive and proactive repairs and maintenance is critical to ensure that residents have access to basic services. Often residents remain without services for months when broken taps and toilets are not fixed.

Significantly less money for repairs and maintenance has been allocated in the 2023/24 draft budget than in 2022/23. The table below shows a 27% decrease for overall repairs and maintenance for all asset classes. The specific allocations for the repairs and maintenance of sanitation and of water infrastructure have also decreased substantially, by 39% and 23% respectively.

The relevant table in the budget document indicates that a share of “0%” of the value of the Metro’s Plant, Property and Equipment (PPE) has been allocated to repairs and maintenance. However, the narrative discussion in the document indicates that 2,2% of the value of PPE has been set aside for repairs and maintenance. While the share of 0% is likely a typing error, the allocation of 2,2% of the value of PPE is far below the National Treasury guideline of 8%.

We cannot see if the City has set aside any allocation specifically for repairs and maintenance in informal settlements. This means that we cannot see how the large cuts in the repairs and maintenance budgets will impact repairs and maintenance in informal settlements.

Table 4: Budget allocation for Repairs and Maintenance

R'000	Adopted Budget	Full year forecast 2022/23	Adjusted Budget 2022/23	Draft 2023/24	% change Adjusted and 2023/24 Draft
Water supply infrastructure	176 053	176 053	176 053	135 540	-23,01%
Sanitation infrastructure	139 114	139 114	139 114	84 613	-39,18%
Total Repairs and Maintenance	1 338 527	1 338 527	1 338 527	975 871	-27,09%
R & M as % of PPE	3,0%	2,60%	3%	0%	

Source: 2023/24 Draft Budget Document page 49 Annexure A; 2022/23 Adjusted Budget page 31

3.6 Grants funding from National Government

There are two main conditional grants that fund informal settlement upgrading, namely the Informal Settlement Upgrading Partnership Grant (ISUPG) and the Urban Settlement Development Grant (USDG). The ISUPG is dedicated to the upgrading of informal settlements, whilst the USDG can, amongst other things, be used for basic service delivery to informal settlements.

The total revenue from these grants has increased by 4,41%. This increase is welcomed, but the lack of detail about how the City has allocated these grants makes it impossible to see if the total increase in the grants will improve informal settlement service delivery.

The Human Settlements Department's draft 2023/24 capital budget has increased substantially by 32% after a decrease in the adjusted 2022/23 budget. This Department is responsible for the implementation of informal settlement upgrading projects. However, the budget doesn't show the funding sources, or the exact deliverables for individual projects, and this lack of information makes it difficult to see what the impact of the overall increase in the Human Settlements capital budget will be on informal settlement upgrading and service delivery.

Table 5: Budget allocation of grants

R'000	2022/23 Approved	Adjusted 2022/23	2023/24 draft	% change
Total Human Settlements capital budget	412 850	305 017	402 945	32,11%
ISUPG	593 685	564 000	588 858	4,41%
USDG	1 044 111	1 012 788	1 057 425	4,41%
Total ISUPG & USDG	1 637 796	1 576 788	1 646 283	4,41%
Human Settlement budget share of grants	25%	19%	24%	

Source: 2023/24 MTREF for each Department / Vote page 29 Appendix A; 2022/23 Adjusted Budget page 11

In the narrative part of the budget document, an operating budget allocation is shown for a project implemented by the Human Settlements Department. It is called "Consultants (civil engineering – formalisation)", but it is unclear if this is a specific allocation for the "formalisation" or upgrading of informal settlements. In previous years (e.g., 2021/22) there was a specific operating budget allocation for the formalisation of informal settlements.

If we assume that this is the same project, we see an increase of almost 7% in the budget. Since this budget funds "consultants" it is probably safe to assume that this provides

funding for informal settlements upgrading in the planning phases. No information is provided about which settlements will benefit from this allocation. See Table 8.

Table 6: Budget allocation for formalisation

R'000	2022/23 Adopted budget	2023/24 draft budget	% change
Consultants (civil engineering formalisation)	52 900	56 600	6,99%

Source: 2023/24 Draft Budget Document page 27; 2022/23 Adopted Budget page 14

References

1. https://www.tshwane.gov.za/?page_id=15859
2. <https://asivikelane.org/wp-content/uploads/2023/03/asivikelane-35-final-1.pdf>
3. <https://asivikelane.org/wp-content/uploads/2023/01/asivikelane-34-final.pdf>