



ASIVIKELANE

LET'S PROTECT ONE ANOTHER

VOICES OF INFORMAL
SETTLEMENT RESIDENTS
ABOUT BASIC SERVICES



Submission to the City of Tshwane 2022/2023 Draft Budget

Date: 4 May 2022

Submitted by: Planact, 1to1 Agency of Engagement and Tshwane Leadership Foundation as part of the Asivikelane Campaign representing informal settlement communities in the City of Tshwane.

Contact details: [Mike Makwela] [0769226054] | Email: [mike@planact.org.za]

1. Key recommendations made by the Asivikelane Campaign, Planact, 1to1 Agency of Engagement, Tshwane Leadership Foundation and International Budget Partnership (IBP) South Africa:

The submission is based on residents' comments on the Integrated Development Plan (IDP), their responses to the draft budget and an analysis of the City's draft 2022/23 budget. In addition to the analysis, the submission offers recommendations for practical steps that the City can take to ensure that the budget responds more fully to the needs of its most vulnerable residents.

- **The City must allocate funds for the installation of more water tanks in informal settlements**

The Tshwane informal settlement communities welcome the big increase to the budget for water tankers (see page 5). However, the water problem is not just about water tankers that deliver water, but also about insufficient tanks to receive the water. It is therefore worrying that the budget does not indicate whether the number of water tanks will also be increased. Communities are in dire need of more water tanks and not just the tankers that deliver the water. The limited number of water tanks in communities results in long queues, empty tanks by the end of the day, and insufficient water for each household.

- **The City must increase the budget allocation for chemical toilets in informal settlements to increase the number of chemical toilets in each settlement and for more consistency in servicing toilets.**

There are not enough chemical toilets in many of Tshwane's informal settlement communities and the unchanged budget for chemical toilets is therefore a big concern for informal settlement communities (see page 4). The City must increase the budget so that there are more toilets in communities and so that the chemical toilets are cleaned and desludged more than once a week. Dignified sanitation in informal settlements is essential to the residents' health and overall human rights.

- **The City must cultivate an environment for innovative waste collection services in informal settlements. This can be done by including a specific and separate budget line item for waste services in informal settlements and an increase in the budget for waste containers.**

Tshwane communities welcome the increase in contracted services for environment and agriculture management (see page 6). However, this increase includes services in formal areas, and it is therefore not clear whether informal settlements will benefit. Having a separate budget for informal settlement waste services will show more clearly the quantity and quality of services that communities can expect. It will also indicate whether the City is committed to funding sustainable and innovative ways to deal with waste collection and rehabilitating of dump sites.

It is also very concerning that the budget for waste containers has decreased with such an alarming amount (see page 6). Waste containers are mostly used in informal settlements and reducing the budget for them may be understood by informal settlement communities as meaning that the City does not prioritise waste collection services in their areas. This is problematic as most informal settlements in Tshwane do not have a consistent waste collection service.

- **The City must increase the budget for public lighting in informal settlements for the safety of residents, especially women and children.**

Tshwane communities applaud the City for increasing the “Electricity for all” budget (see page 7) because every informal settlement household needs electricity. Every informal settlement community also needs public lighting to help keep communities safe at night. Therefore, the decrease in the *public lighting project* is a great concern to Tshwane communities (see page 7). The safety of residents, especially women and children is affected, particularly because so many residents use communal services outside of daylight hours, and so the decrease in the public lighting budget is of grave concern to informal settlement communities.

- **The City must have a dedicated repairs and maintenance budget for informal settlements**

Although the City’s repairs and maintenance budget has slightly increased, it is concerning that there is no dedicated repairs and maintenance budget for informal settlements (see page 8). Repairs and maintenance in informal settlements is of great concern because many taps and toilets have minor issues that are not being attended to. This results in communities not having access to water and sanitation, even in areas that already have these services installed.

What is also worrisome is that the City does not show the share of its repairs and maintenance budget as a percentage of the value of its Property, Plant and Equipment (PPE). This makes it impossible to compare this share with the National Treasury guideline of 8% (see page 8). If this information was in the budget, the community would have a good idea of how committed the City is to repairing and maintaining assets that are in informal settlements.

- **The City must be more transparent when it comes to upgrading projects**

The increase of the upgrading grants is welcomed by the community; however, this increase is not big enough to fund the City’s plans to upgrade 100 informal settlements over the next three years (see page 9). Furthermore, the budget does not show which informal settlements will benefit from the increase of the grants or when they can expect upgrading to start.

There is also an alarming decrease in the budget for the project “Formalisation of informal settlements” (see page 9). Although, once again, there is no detail in the budget of what “Formalisation” entails, one can

assume that this is intended to benefit informal settlement residents who already have little to no access to several services because of not being reblocked and not having access to available land.

Asivikelane assessment of informal settlement services in Tshwane

Planact, 1to1 and the Tshwane Leadership Foundation (TLF) are NGOs that have been working with informal settlements for over 40 years. Recently, with IBP South Africa and other partner organisations, they formed the Asivikelane campaign. This initiative supports informal settlement communities in monitoring water, sanitation and refuse collection and in engaging with their metro about these services. The objective of the initiative is to give a voice to informal settlement residents who face severe basic services shortages in South Africa's major cities.

2. Service delivery challenges experienced by Tshwane residents

Evidence collected by the Asivikelane campaign shows that residents living in informal settlements face several service delivery challenges.

2.1 Inadequate access to sanitation

Almost 15% of the metro's residents do not have any toilets in their settlements and many others rely on self-dug pit toilets. Residents who use chemical toilets said these are broken and too many households have to share one toilet. Additional chemical toilets are needed to both improve access to sanitation and reduce the number of households currently sharing one toilet.

In addition, in April 2022, 43% of residents said that their chemical and pit toilets were not cleaned or drained in the previous seven days.

2.2 Insufficient water supply to informal settlements

In April 2022, 33.7% of residents said they did not have enough water in the previous week. About 10% of residents reported that they do not have access to any water at all. Residents who rely on water tanks for water reported that there are not enough tanks, and some are broken. Residents who use communal taps said that some of their taps are broken.

2.3 Lack of access to waste removal services

Residents have raised waste collection as a major challenge in the metro. In April 2022, 48.3% of residents said that they do not receive waste removal services. Residents who do receive the service said that they do not receive enough refuse bags from the metro and therefore struggle to dispose of refuse in an orderly manner.

2.4 Public lighting and electricity provision in informal settlements

In August 2021, 92% of residents said that there is not enough public lighting in their settlements. While there are high mast lights in some settlements, residents reported that there are either not enough lights or that the lights are broken. The lack of public lighting poses a safety risk to women and children especially, and therefore reduces the accessibility of taps and toilets.

2.5 Inadequate repairs and maintenance

The lack of maintenance and repairs is a major challenge in the metro’s informal settlements, with residents continuously reporting that their taps, toilets or water tanks are not fixed when they break. In March 2022, 25% of residents said that their broken tap, toilet or water tank was never fixed after they reported it to the metro. Another 21% of residents said that it took between one and three months for broken taps and toilets to be fixed.

Fault reporting response times when Tshwane residents lodge a water and sanitation complaint

Fixed	Number	%
A week or less	31	34.07%
A month or less	2	2.20%
1 to 3 months	19	20.88%
Never	23	25.27%
I don't know	16	17.58%
Total	91	100%

*Source: Asivikelane 25 analysis results (data collected in March 2022).

3. Evidence from the 2022/23 draft budget: where should the metro make adjustments?

Based on these service delivery issues highlighted by the Asivikelane campaign, we have focused in this analysis on the allocations in the metro’s draft budget for water, sanitation, electricity, refuse removal and informal settlement upgrading.

3.1 Budget allocation for sanitation

The metro’s draft 2022/23 IDP scorecard has set a target for 2022/23 of ensuring that 64% of households in the metro have access to basic sanitation by the end of the financial year. This is the same as the current baseline. The target increases marginally over the next five years to 65% of households by 2026/27. While this shows that the metro will not fall further behind in sanitation provision, it does leave a significant backlog of 35% of households without access to basic sanitation.

Chemical toilets

However, it must be noted that this effort to not fall behind is not supported by the necessary budget allocations. The 2022/23 budget allocation for the provision of chemical toilets remains unchanged from 2021/22, at R37,5 million, which means that no provision is made for the inevitable growth in informal settlements.

Human Settlements Operating Budget

	2021/22	2022/23
Sanitation Chemical Toilets	R37,5 million	R37,5 million

*Source: Draft MTREF 2021/22 and MTREF 2022/23

According to the draft IDP scorecard, the City plans to provide 701 serviced sites with a sewer connection in the coming financial year. The IDP, however, does not provide a budget allocation for this and it is not clear which of the projects listed in the capital budget will deliver these connections.

The Human Settlements capital budget funds several projects which includes an area name and “Sewer provision” in the project name, and reference to “sewer infrastructure” and/or “sewer reticulation to stands” in the project description. While these projects will increase access to sanitation, it is unclear from the names of the areas, as well as from the project description, which of these areas are or include informal settlements. It is also unclear if the additional spending on sanitation infrastructure will include the delivery of flush toilets on serviced stands, as well as ensure access to sanitation for disabled/wheelchair-bound members of the communities.

3.2 Budget allocations for water

The City wants to ensure that by the end of 2022/23, 77% of households in Tshwane have access to a basic level of water. As is the case with sanitation, it intends to increase this target only marginally to 78% in 2026/27, which will also leave a significant backlog in access to water.

The City provides water tankers as an interim solution to informal settlements without access to taps. It refers to these tankers as rudimentary services and plans to provide water tankers to 138 settlements in 2022/23.

Increase in the provision of water tankers

Both the departments of Human Settlements and of Water and Sanitation include a budget item for the provision of water tankers. The Human Settlements department has a bigger budget for the provision of these tankers. While this budget increases by 13% in 2022/23, the metro doesn’t tell us how many additional tankers will be provided with this funding and how many additional settlements will benefit. It is therefore difficult to assess whether the City has allocated enough funding to enable it to realize its laudable IDP targets.

Department of Human Settlements operating budget

	2021/22	2022/23	% change
Water Tankers (Rudimentary services)	R258 million	R291.7 million	13%

*Source: Draft MTREF 2021/22 and MTREF 2022/23

The Water and Sanitation department has set aside a further R49 million for water tankers in 2022/23. This allocation is almost double the 2021/22 budget of R27,1 million, but, again, no information is provided on how many (if any) additional tankers this will fund and which settlements will benefit from this allocation.¹ According to the draft IDP scorecard, the City also plans to provide 2504 serviced stands with access to water, but the scorecard doesn’t provide a budget for this. The Human Settlements department’s capital budget funds a number of projects which will improve access to water in Tshwane. Similar to the capital budget allocations for sanitation, the project names include area names and “Water provision”, and the project descriptions include reference to “water infrastructure” and/or “water reticulation to stands”. But, again, it is unclear if informal settlement households will receive *taps* on serviced stands as part of these projects or just bulk infrastructure, with residents responsible for their own taps or standpipes.

3.3 Budget allocations for refuse removal

¹ <https://www.tshwane.gov.za/sites/Departments/Financial-Services/Financial-Documents/Approved%20MTREF/21.%20Draft%202022%202023%20MTREF%20for%20the%20City%20of%20Tshwane.pdf>, page 14

The metro wants to provide 90% of “known” informal settlements with basic refuse removal services, which means that a backlog of 10% will remain. The current backlog in the settlements participating in Asivikelane is severe, with almost 50% of residents not receiving a refuse removal service.

The metro does not have a separate budget allocation for refuse removal in informal settlements, so it is not clear if it has allocated enough funding to pay for these ambitious targets. The budget does include an item for the provision of waste containers (including skips), which may also fund the delivery of these containers to informal settlements. This budget has however decreased by 67% from 2021/22, suggesting that the budget does not support the targets that the metro has set.

	2021/22	2022/23	% change
Provision of waste containers	R15 million	R5 million	67%

*Source: Draft MTREF 2021/22 and MTREF 2022/23

The collection of refuse is done by external service providers, using their own refuse collection trucks. These providers are appointed from the Contracted Services budget of the Department of Environment and Agriculture Management. The budget has increased slightly by 4.7%, but it is unclear if the specific share going to the refuse collection contractors has increased. In any event, this small increase also does not support the 90% coverage targeted by the metro.

	2021/22 draft budget	2022/23 draft budget	% change
Contracted Services: Environment and Agriculture Management	R762,47 million	R798, 4 million	4,7%

*Source: Draft MTREF 2021/22 and MTREF 2022/23

3.3 Budget allocations for electrification

The City wants to ensure that 93,5% of all households have access to electricity by the end of 2022/23. This target increases to 95,5% in 2026/27, which will leave a relatively small backlog in comparison to other basic services.

The budget allocation for the provision of electricity through the “Electricity for All” project has increased by 79%, suggesting that the metro is prioritising addressing the electricity backlog.

There is also a project called “Tshwane public lighting programme”. It is unclear if this project also provides public lighting to informal settlements. The budget has decreased significantly by 86% from 2021/22, which is a cause for concern. We would urge the City to budget sufficiently for public lighting in informal settlements as it has a tremendous impact on residents’ safety and access to all other services.

	2021/22 draft budget	2022/23 draft budget	% change
Electricity for All	R93.7 million	R168 million	79%
Tshwane public lighting programme	R95 million	R13 million	-86%

3.4 Repairs and maintenance in informal settlements

The evidence from Asivikelane has proven that repairs and maintenance are critical to ensuring that residents have access to basic services, as a lack of this has seen residents remain without services for months.

We welcome the fact that the total repairs and maintenance budget for the City increases slightly to R1.4 billion in 2022/23 and amounts to about 3.2% of the total operating expenditure.² But given the lack of detailed information, it is not possible to assess whether this increase will address the crisis in the repairs and maintenance in informal settlement taps and toilets. Unlike other metros, the City also does not show the share of its repairs and maintenance budget as a percentage of the value of its Property, Plant and Equipment (PPE). This makes it impossible to compare this share with the National Treasury guideline of 8%. The City does, however, seem to have prioritised repairs and maintenance strategically because it has a department that specifically deals with repairs and maintenance of basic service infrastructure – the Regional Operations and Coordination department (ROC).

A little more detail is available in ROC’s operating budget for 2022/23. The draft operating budget lists the following projects that might include allocations for informal settlements:

Budget item	2022/23
Repairs and maintenance of infrastructure and community facilities	R651,3 million
Electricity main supply and electricity reticulation	R168,4 million
Stormwater systems and water reticulation	R98,7 million

*Source: Draft MTREF 2021/22 and MTREF 2022/23

The City should make sure that these budget items specifically set aside money for the item “repairs and maintenance of infrastructure in informal settlements” as it is not shown separately in the budget.

3.5 Informal settlement upgrading

Mayor Randall Williams has once again signalled the City’s commitment to informal settlement upgrading in his State of the Capital address. He said in his speech that the City has begun implementing their Informal Settlements Upgrading Strategy where the City has now “assessed and categorised all informal settlements in its jurisdiction”. He said 145 settlements, out of more than 200, can be developed and town planners have been appointed to proceed with township establishment and approval of plans for about 100 informal settlements in the next three years. While the City said the informal settlements are in all seven regions, they

², page 10.

have not provided a list of the settlements which will benefit from the development. We also have concerns about the adequacy of the budget allocations to support the mayor's vision.

	Draft 2021/22	Draft 2022/23
Informal Settlements Upgrading Partnership Grant (ISUPG)	R560,30 million	R593.7 million
Urban Settlement Development Grant (USDG)	R1.02 billion	R1.01 billion

*Source: Draft MTREF 2021/22 and MTREF 2022/23

There are two main conditional grants that fund informal settlement upgrading, namely the Informal Settlement Upgrading Partnership Grant (ISUPG) and the Urban Settlement Development Grant (USDG). The ISUPG is dedicated to the upgrading of informal settlements, whilst the USDG can, amongst other things, be used for basic service delivery to informal settlements.

The USDG has increased slightly while the ISUPG has increased by R33.4 million. These increases are welcomed, although the lack of detail regarding which source funds which project makes it difficult to see what the funds are used for.

The budget should be clear on which items are related to settlement upgrading, explain what will be provided, and show clearly which settlements will benefit from these upgrading projects. We also propose that the entire upgrading strategy, together with the names and plans for each settlement, be made public so that residents can monitor what is being delivered on the ground.

There is also a project under the human settlements operating budget which provides for the formalisation of informal settlements, but it is not known what this budget item, which was dramatically reduced, entails and whether it is related to the implementation of the upgrading plan.

	Draft 2021/22	Draft 2022/23
Formalisation of informal settlements	R70,4 million	R2.2 million ³

*Source: Draft MTREF 2021/22 and MTREF 2022/23

Source list:

1. Draft Medium Term Revenue Expenditure Framework 2022/23 : <https://www.tshwane.gov.za/sites/Departments/Financial-Services/Financial-Documents/Approved%20MTREF/21.%20Draft%202022%202023%20MTREF%20for%20the%20City%20of%20Tshwane.pdf>
2. Draft Integrated Development Plan: 2022/23 <https://www.tshwane.gov.za/sites/Council/Ofiice-Of-The-Executive-Mayor/20162017%20IDP/20.%20Tabling%20of%20CoT%202022%202026%20IDP%20Review%20for%20public%20comment.pdf>

³ <https://www.tshwane.gov.za/sites/Departments/Financial-Services/Financial-Documents/Approved%20MTREF/21.%20Draft%202022%202023%20MTREF%20for%20the%20City%20of%20Tshwane.pdf>, page 13.

3. Randall Williams - State of the Capital Address :
[https://www.tshwane.gov.za/sites/about_tshwane/CityManagement/State%20of%20The%20City%20Addresses/State%20of%20the%20Capital%20Address%202022%20FINAL%2020April%20\(EdVN\).pdf](https://www.tshwane.gov.za/sites/about_tshwane/CityManagement/State%20of%20The%20City%20Addresses/State%20of%20the%20Capital%20Address%202022%20FINAL%2020April%20(EdVN).pdf)
4. Draft 2021/22 MTREF : <https://www.tshwane.gov.za/sites/Departments/Financial-Services/Financial-Documents/Approved%20MTREF/15.%20Draft%202021%202022%20MTREF%20for%20the%20City%20of%20Tshwane.pdf>
5. Asivikelane data : <https://asivikelane.org/releases/>
6. <https://planact.org.za/>
7. <https://1to1.org.za/about/>
8. <https://tlf.org.za/>