



ASIVIKELANE

LET'S PROTECT ONE ANOTHER

VOICES OF INFORMAL
SETTLEMENT RESIDENTS
ABOUT BASIC SERVICES



Submission to eThekweni Municipality 2022/2023 Draft Budget

Date: 13, May 2022

Submitted by: South African Shack Dwellers International Alliance as part of the Asivikelane Campaign representing informal settlements communities in eThekweni Municipality.

Contact details: [Samke P. Phewa] [0766925745/0313049694] [patience@corc.co.za]

Following an analysis of eThekweni's 2022/23 draft budget, we would like the following recommendations to be considered for the final budget. We see this as an opportunity for the City to improve access to basic services across informal settlements in eThekweni. We hope these suggestions are considered in the final budget and priorities.

1. The City must set aside a specific budget allocation for routine maintenance and repairs of communal taps and Community Ablution Blocks in informal settlements. The lack of maintenance and repairs is a major challenge, with residents continuously reporting that their communal taps run dry, are broken, or have low water pressure. As a result, almost half of the toilets in the communal ablation blocks are broken or blocked, leaving them unusable for months. Yet the 2022/23 Draft Budget shows that the Municipality is *allocating less to repairs and maintenance as a % of the value of their Plant, Property and Equipment (PPE)*. The City's own Integrated Development Plan (IDP) acknowledges that it will take at least 90 years to address the housing backlog, given current funding levels and an estimated 1% annual population growth. So, improving budget allocations for repairs and maintenance will advance and ensure uninterrupted access to basic services for residents living in informal settlements.
2. We would like the City to provide budgets that are more detailed for Informal Settlements Upgrading Projects. There is a huge demand for alternative serviced land and housing, specifically for people who have lived in transit camps for over 9 years, as well as people living in informal settlements on private land with no basic services, like Mandeni informal settlement and 307 Avoca informal settlement. We are noting the important *Housing Upgrading Programme* the City is planning through the (1) in-situ upgrading and (2) Greenfields projects. The budget documents, do not, however, list the settlements included in these projects or the specific services (taps, toilets, refuse or electricity) that will be delivered. It is also unclear if this allocation is for connective infrastructure only or



includes installation of the top structures. These details will enable us to monitor budget implementation with the City during the coming financial year.

3. We demand detailed budget information for the delivery of new services like water and sanitation infrastructure for informal settlements that do not have any. Several informal settlements do not have access to toilets at all and others have fewer toilets than the stipulated household to toilet ratio. While there are numerous capital projects in the Human Settlements and Engineering Unit's budgets, no information is given on what will be delivered on the ground, and in many cases, it is unclear which informal settlements will benefit from a specific project.
4. The City must reconsider the significant decrease in the budget allocation for Community Ablution Blocks (CABS). In the draft Medium Term Revenue and Expenditure Framework (MTREF), the allocation for this project has decreased by almost 50% from R20 million in 2021/22 to R10.8 million in 2022/23. This will negatively impact access to sanitation in informal settlements. We would like the budget to increase.
5. The City must improve service delivery monitoring, contract management, oversight of outsourced service providers and strengthen the role of residents in service delivery monitoring.
6. The City must increase the budget and improve contract monitoring for refuse removal in informal settlements. While the Metro shows no backlogs for refuse removal, many residents have consistently indicated that they do not receive a refuse removal service. We also know that several settlements receive an irregular or inconsistent service. We request additional budget allocations to enable increases in personnel numbers, the number of refuse removal trucks and frequency of collections to ensure that all dumping sights in informal settlements are thoroughly cleared. In addition to serving residents, this will also limit the creation of further "illegal" dumping sites.
7. The City must put aside specific budget allocation for programs that enhance livelihood opportunities for residents in informal settlements. These could support communities who have already started food gardening projects; early childhood centres; soup kitchens; provide minor repairs and maintenance of infrastructure etc.
8. Our analysis focused on the budget allocations for basic service delivery to informal settlements and this informed our recommendations. But, in the light of the recent floods, we would urge the Metro to consider if it has budgeted adequately for responding to emergency or unforeseen natural disasters such as storms, floods and fires. The recent flooding has left many residents without access to basic services. It also showed poor coordination in the provision of shelter or alternative accommodation, and that informal settlements are poorly connected to stormwater infrastructure and fire hydrants.

A. Asivikelane assessment of informal settlements services in eThekweni

Recently, SASDI along with the International Budget Partnership South Africa (IBP South Africa) and other partner organisations formed the Asivikelane campaign.¹ This initiative supports informal settlement communities to monitor water, sanitation and refuse collection and to engage with their metro about these services. The objective of the initiative is to give a voice to informal settlement residents in South Africa's major cities who face severe basic service shortages.

¹ <https://asivikelane.org/>

Service delivery challenges experienced by eThekweni informal settlement residents

Evidence collected by the Asivikelane campaign shows that residents living in informal settlements face several service delivery challenges.

Insufficient water supply

In April 2022, 66% of residents participating in Asivikelane said that they did not have enough water in the previous week. About 15% of residents reported that they do not have any access to water.

The majority of residents rely on communal taps and many reported that there are not enough taps in their settlements; many taps and pipes are broken; the water pressure is low; and the supply is sometimes interrupted.

Inadequate access to sanitation

While 6% of residents do not have access to a toilet, a further 24% said that they had to dig their own pit toilets because they do not have access to municipal-provided sanitation.

More than half of residents use communal ablution blocks. Residents experience many challenges with these facilities, with broken and blocked toilets the most common. In some settlements toilets have been closed for months because of these issues.

In addition, in April 2022, 45% of residents who use communal toilets said their toilets were not cleaned in the previous seven days.

Lack of access to waste removal services

Waste collection is also a challenge, with 21% of residents saying in April 2022 that they do not receive such a service. A further 33% reported that although their waste is collected, it happens irregularly.

Public lighting and electricity

In August 2022, three-quarters of residents said that there is not enough public lighting in their settlement, with many saying that there are no streetlights at all. The lack of public lighting poses a safety risk to especially women and children and therefore reduces the accessibility of the communal ablution blocks.

Inadequate repairs and maintenance

The lack of maintenance and repairs is a major challenge in eThekweni's informal settlements, with residents continuously reporting that they cannot use toilets or do not have enough water because of broken toilets and taps.

In March 2022, 42% of residents said that their broken tap or toilet was never fixed after they reported it to the Metro. A further 42% said that it took more than a week for broken taps or toilets to be fixed.

Fault reporting response times

| | |
|-----------------------|------|
| In a week or less | 6% |
| In a month or less | 22% |
| Between 1 to 3 months | 20% |
| Never | 42% |
| I don't know | 9% |
| Total | 100% |

B. The delivery of basic services to the eThekweni metro's informal settlements: What is the draft 2022/23 Budget telling us?

1. Basic services backlog in eThekweni

According to the 2022/23 draft Integrated Development Plan (IDP), at the end of April 2021 the housing backlog in the Metro stood at 468 000 dwellings, with 314 000 (or 67%) of these households living in urban and suburban informal settlements. The IDP further states that it will take over 90 years to address the housing backlog, given current funding levels and an estimated 1% annual population growth.²

The IDP also shows the backlogs for basic services (see Table 1 below). The backlogs are given per “consumer units”. While the IDP does not provide a definition of consumer units, it is safe to assume that, like the housing backlog, the services backlogs include informal settlement households, as well as households living in backyards and traditional dwellings. The backlogs below confirm the evidence from Asivikelane, except for refuse removal. While the Metro shows no backlogs for refuse removal, more than 20% of residents who participated in Asivikelane in April 2022 indicated that they do not receive a refuse removal service.

The Metro's own information confirms the severity of the basic service backlog. It estimates that with its current budget allocations, it will take 27-47 years to provide all households with electricity, 63-94 years to provide all households with water, and a massive 99-148 years to ensure that all households have access to sanitation.

Table 1: Basic services backlogs in eThekweni, at December 2021

| Basic Service | Existing backlog (consumer units) | Delivery ranges per annum | Timeframe to address backlog based on current funding levels |
|----------------------|--|----------------------------------|---|
| Water | 187 790 | 2 000 – 3 000 | 63 - 94 years |
| Sanitation | 296 133 | 2 000 – 3 000 | 99 – 148 years |
| Electricity | 374 544 | 8 000 - 14 000 | 27 - 47 years |
| Refuse removal | 0 | 1 500 - 2 000 | 0 years |

Source: eThekweni Municipality. 2022. **Integrated Development Plan 2022/23 to 2026/27. 2022/23 Review**. Available online http://www.durban.gov.za/City_Government/City_Vision/IDP/Documents/IDP5YearPlan2022_23.pdf . Page 530

In addition to the backlog, inadequate repairs and maintenance of existing taps and toilets is making the situation even worse. Over the last two years, residents who participate in the Asivikelane initiative have consistently reported that broken and leaking taps, pipes and toilets prevent them from accessing adequate

² eThekweni Municipality. 2022. **Integrated Development Plan 2022/23 to 2026/27. 2022/23 Review**. Available online http://www.durban.gov.za/City_Government/City_Vision/IDP/Documents/IDP5YearPlan2022_23.pdf Page 222

water and sanitation. In March 2022, 42% of residents said the Metro never fixes their broken taps or toilets. A further 42% said that repairs take between a week and 3 months.

2. The Metro's approach to the delivery of basic services to informal settlements

The eThekweni metro uses two main programmes to deliver basic services to informal settlement residents.³ The *Housing Upgrading Programme* provides serviced sites and top structures in two different ways: (1) in-situ upgrading where informal settlements are upgraded in their current sites and (2) Greenfields projects. Improve service delivery monitoring, contract management and oversight of service providers. Ensure you strengthen the role of residents in monitoring its, where informal settlement residents are relocated and receive serviced site and top structures on vacant sites.

The Metro recognises, however, that a relatively small number of households are benefiting from these housing upgrading programmes, and that this programme will also take too long to address the housing backlog. It is therefore attempting to upscale its *Incremental Services to Informal Settlements Programme*, the second main programme delivering basic services to informal settlements. The IDP states that it is the Metro's "intention" to scale up these incremental services to as many as 10 000 households per year over the next few years.

The Incremental Service Programme provides interim basic services to settlements which are in the Metro's Housing Plan, but not scheduled to receive full serviced sites or top structures in the short term. It should be noted that settlements that *have* been identified for relocation will not benefit from this programme and will not be provided with incremental services in the interim. The package of interim services includes:

- communal ablution blocks that provide water and sanitation services
- basic road networks and footpaths with storm water controls
- electricity connections
- refuse removal services

The communal ablution blocks provide toilets, shower and clothes washing facilities and are connected to the municipal sewerage system. In areas where a connection to the sewerage system is unavailable, sanitation is provided by a toilet block with toilets and urinals only with no water supply. Such toilets are each connected to its own Ventilated Improved Pit (VIP) toilet. According to the draft 2022/23 IDP, the basic levels of access to water and sanitation are a standpipe for water and an ablution block/toilet, within 200 metres of each household's stand.⁴

The basic levels of access to electricity and refuse removal for informal settlements are less specific, but appear to be connection to the main electricity supply and a weekly waste removal service.⁵

While the draft 2022/23 IDP provides information on the Metro's approach to the delivery of basic services to informal settlements, the draft IDP does not provide any information on the number or the specific informal settlements that are going to benefit from the programmes described above.

3. Evidence from the Metro's 2022/23 draft budget

³ eThekweni Municipality. 2022. **Integrated Development Plan 2022/23 to 2026/27. 2022/23 Review.** Available online http://www.durban.gov.za/City_Government/City_Vision/IDP/Documents/IDP5YearPlan2022_23.pdf Pages 230, 526, 527

⁴ eThekweni Municipality. 2022. **Integrated Development Plan 2022/23 to 2026/27. 2022/23 Review.** Available online http://www.durban.gov.za/City_Government/City_Vision/IDP/Documents/IDP5YearPlan2022_23.pdf Page 221

⁵ eThekweni Municipality. 2022. **Integrated Development Plan 2022/23 to 2026/27. 2022/23 Review.** Available online http://www.durban.gov.za/City_Government/City_Vision/IDP/Documents/IDP5YearPlan2022_23.pdf Pages 541, 544

3.1 Budget allocations for the provision of Incremental Services

The draft 2022/23 budget itself does not provide a total budget for the provision of basic services as part of the *Incremental Services to Informal Settlements Programme*. We attempted to identify projects and budget items in the metro’s draft capital budget, which could possibly be part of this programme. Table 2 shows the names of these projects as well as the budget allocations for the current financial year (2021/22) and the draft allocations for 2022/23. As discussed in detail below the table, the metro is planning to spend less money on these projects in 2022/23, which doesn’t support its intention to “scale up” the provision of incremental services.

Table 2: Possible projects under the Incremental Services to Informal Settlements Programme

| Department | Project | 2021/22 Final budget | 2022/23 Draft budget | % change 2021/22 – 2022/23 | 2023/24 Draft budget | 2024/25 Draft budget |
|------------------------------------|--|-------------------------|-------------------------|----------------------------------|----------------------------|----------------------------|
| R thousand | | | | | | |
| Trading Service: Electricity | Informal Settlements (Sundry EFA informal block sum) | 40 000 | 25 000 | -38% | 30 000 | 30 000 |
| Trading Service: Electricity | Ablution floodlights | 200 | 200 | No change | 400 | 412 |
| Trading Service: Electricity | Ablution solar lighting | 500 | 500 | No change | 1 000 | - |
| Trading Service: Sanitation | Community Ablution Blocks | 20 000 | 10 800 | -46% | 20 234 | 124 |

Source: eThekweni Municipality. 2021. *Medium Term Revenue and Expenditure Framework 2021/22 to 2023/24*. Available online http://www.durban.gov.za/Resource_Centre/reports/Documents/EthekwiniMunicipality_202122_MediumTermBudgetFinal.pdf; eThekweni Municipality. 2022. *Medium Term Revenue and Expenditure Framework 2022/23 to 2024/25*. Available online. http://www.durban.gov.za/Resource_Centre/reports/Budget/Documents/2022-2023b.pdf

The *Informal Settlements (Sundry EFA informal block sum)* project provides electricity to informal settlements and the budget for this project has decreased by 38% from R40 million in 2021/22 to R25 million in 2022/23. The budget also does not provide any information on which settlements will benefit from this project and when. There are two smaller projects which provide floodlights and solar lighting to ablution facilities, and the budgets for these remain unchanged in 2022/23. (It should be noted that we do not know for sure that these two projects will provide lighting to communal ablution facilities in informal settlements.)

The *Communal Ablution Blocks* project provides sanitation to informal settlements. In the draft MTREF, the allocation for this project has decreased by almost 50% from R20 million in 2021/22 to R10.8 million in 2022/23. The narrative part of the Metro’s budget document, however, claims that over the three years of the 2022/23 – 2024/25 MTREF, R171,2 million has been allocated in the capital budget for “Ablution blocks-upgrade: informal settlements”. And a press release on the budget also claims an allocation of R170 million for “ablution block upgrades in informal settlements” as a “major capital programme” in the 2022/23 MTREF.⁶ We could not find any information about the nature of the R170 million allocation in either the

⁶See eThekweni Municipality. 2022. *Medium Term Revenue and Expenditure Framework 2022/23 to 2024/25*. Available online. http://www.durban.gov.za/Resource_Centre/reports/Budget/Documents/2022-2023b.pdf Page 48 of

press release or the budget document. The budget also does not provide information on which settlements will benefit from any allocation for the provision or upgrading of communal ablution blocks or when such upgrading will take place.

3.2 Budget allocations for the maintenance and repairs of taps and toilets in informal settlements

As indicated above, the poor state of repairs and maintenance makes the basic services backlog even worse than it is. It is therefore of some concern that the budget does not provide any information on how much money has been set aside for the maintenance and repairs of taps, toilets and ablution blocks in informal settlements. In fact, it is unclear if the Metro ringfences any share at all of its maintenance and repairs budget for informal settlements.

The draft budget provides estimates of how much of the water and sanitation operating budgets has been set aside for maintenance and repairs generally (all areas, not just informal settlements). Table 3 shows that in 2022/23 the allocation from the water operating budget has decreased by 4% from R400 million to R383 million, while the allocation from the sanitation operating budget has decreased by 9% from R222 million to R202 million. This reduction confirms our concerns about repairs and maintenance in informal settlements and the rest of the Metro.

Table 3: Budget allocations for maintenance and repairs in the water and sanitation operating budgets

| R million | 2021/22 Final budget | 2022/23 Draft budget | % change |
|------------|-------------------------|-------------------------|----------|
| Water | 400 | 383 | -4,25% |
| Sanitation | 222 | 202 | -9% |

Source: eThekweni Municipality. 2021. *Medium Term Revenue and Expenditure Framework 2021/22 to 2023/24*. Available online http://www.durban.gov.za/Resource_Centre/reports/Documents/EthekwiniMunicipality_202122_MediumTermBudgetFinal.pdf Pages 39,40 of 371;

eThekweni Municipality. 2022. *Medium Term Revenue and Expenditure Framework 2022/23 to 2024/25*. Available online. http://www.durban.gov.za/Resource_Centre/reports/Budget/Documents/2022-2023b.pdf Pages 38,39 of 334

Note: The budget document only provides estimates for the 2022/23 year, and not for the other 2 years of the 2022/23-2024/25 MTREF period, or a full year forecast for 2021/22. The 2021/22 allocation is from that year's final budget.

The Metro also provides an estimate of how much is being spent on repairs and maintenance by asset class (a standard measure across all municipalities). According to this classification, the Metro is planning to spend the same on the repairs and maintenance of both water supply and sanitation infrastructure in 2022/23 as it did in 2021/22. Its overall maintenance budget is set to decrease by 4%, but we welcome the fact that the budgets for water supply and sanitation infrastructure are not negatively impacted by the overall decrease.

According to the National Treasury guideline, municipalities should budget 8% of the value of their PPE for maintenance and repairs of infrastructure.⁷ Table 4 shows that in 2021/22 the Metro budgeted 6.7% of the value of its PPE, but as a result of the decrease in its overall repairs and maintenance budget, this share is set to decrease to 6.2% in 2022/23. While not meeting the benchmark, this percentage is higher than in most other metros.

334 and http://www.durban.gov.za/Resource_Centre/new2/Pages/City%E2%80%99s-capital-budget-to-emphasise-economic-development.aspx

⁷ See <http://mfma.treasury.gov.za/Circulars/Pages/Circular71.aspx>

Table 4: Repairs and Maintenance by Asset Class (water and sanitation only)

| R million | 2021/22 | 2022/23 | % change | 2023/24 | 2024/25 |
|--|---------|---------|----------|---------|---------|
| Water Supply Infrastructure | 380 | 380 | 0% | 407 | 435 |
| Sanitation Infrastructure | 354 | 353 | 0% | 360 | 367 |
| Total Repairs and Maintenance | 3 693 | 3 551 | -4% | 3 914 | 4 109 |
| <i>Repairs and Maintenance as % of PPE</i> | 6.7% | 6.2% | | 6.6% | 6.7% |

Source: eThekweni Municipality. 2022. **Medium Term Revenue and Expenditure Framework 2022/23 to 2024/25**. Available online. http://www.durban.gov.za/Resource_Centre/reports/Budget/Documents/2022-2023b.pdf Page 96 of 334

3.3 Refuse removal

The budget doesn't tell us whether, or how much, money has been set aside for refuse removal in informal settlements. As indicated above, the Metro also doesn't acknowledge that there is a backlog in the delivery of refuse removal services to informal settlements.

The budget does provide an allocation for refuse removal bags, but it does not specify how much of this allocation is for the provision of refuse bags to informal settlement residents specifically. It is also concerning that the overall budget for refuse removal bags has decreased by 18% from 2021/22 and 2022/23.

Table 5: Budget allocations for refuse removal bags

| R million | 2021/22 Final budget | 2022/23 Draft budget | % change |
|---------------------|-------------------------|-------------------------|----------|
| Refuse removal bags | 94 | 77 | -18% |

Source: eThekweni Municipality. 2021. **Medium Term Revenue and Expenditure Framework 2021/22 to 2023/24**. Available online

http://www.durban.gov.za/Resource_Centre/reports/Documents/EthekweniMunicipality_202122_MediumTermBudgetFinal.pdf Page 87 of 371;

eThekweni Municipality. 2022. **Medium Term Revenue and Expenditure Framework 2022/23 to 2024/25**. Available online.

http://www.durban.gov.za/Resource_Centre/reports/Budget/Documents/2022-2023b.pdf Page 77 of 334

Note: The draft budget document only provides an estimate for the 2022/23 year, and not for the other 2 years of the 2022/23-2024/25 MTREF period. The draft budget also doesn't provide a full-year forecast estimate for 2021/22 and the 2021/22 allocation is taken from the final 2021/22 budget.

3.4 Allocations for specific areas in the Human Settlements and the Engineering capital budgets

As discussed above, the Housing Upgrading Programme and the Incremental Services Programme are responsible for the delivery of basic services to informal settlements. While other departments, such as those in Trading Services (Electricity, Water, Sanitation and Refuse Removal) are responsible for the delivery of some of the services, the narratives in the draft IDP and budget indicate that the main implementing department is the department of Human Settlements, Engineering and Transport Authority, specifically the units responsible for Human Settlements and possibly Engineering.

The capital budget of the Human Settlements Unit includes all human settlements projects, and it therefore also includes allocations for functions such as the provision of rental housing, title deeds and management of other infrastructure. The capital budget of the Engineering Unit seems to include amongst other things the provision of roads and stormwater. We have seen in Section 2 above that basic road networks and footpaths with storm water controls are included in the package of incremental services to informal settlements, and that is why we think the unit might also be responsible for the delivery of incremental services.

But capital budgets of the Human Settlements and Engineering Units do not provide separate budgets for the different functions that they are responsible for. Most of the project names include a reference to a specific

area, which might or might not include an informal settlement. Other project names include reference to roads or stormwater. It is, however, not possible to determine from the capital budget tables what is actually being delivered on the ground, and whether an informal settlement is benefitting from a project. The fact that the budget document includes different capital budget formats adds to the confusion. For example, many of the projects listed under the Human Settlements Unit in the Detailed Capital Budget section of the draft budget document (see page 313 of 344 onwards) have an asset class as “other” or “road infrastructure” next to the name of the project in the Supporting Table SA36 (see page 209 of 344 onwards).

The capital budget of the overall of Human Settlements, Engineering and Transport Authority, as well as the budgets of the Human Settlements and Engineering Units, have all decreased by roughly a third between 2021/22 and 2022/23. As explained above, it is not possible to determine the exact allocations for informal settlement upgrading (housing upgrading) and incremental services projects. The decrease in the capital budget seen here does, however, raise the question to what extent the Metro is prioritising service delivery to informal settlements through its various interventions. There is also no clear evidence in the budget to support the Metro’s intention of scaling up the provision of incremental services over the coming years.

Table 6: Human Settlements and Engineering capital budgets

| R million | 2021/22 | 2022/23 | % change | 2023/24 | 2024/25 |
|---|--------------|--------------|-------------|--------------|--------------|
| Human Settlements, Engineering & Transport Authority | 2 304 | 1 672 | -27% | 1 673 | 1 849 |
| Human Settlements | 1 002 | 642 | -36% | 305 | 426 |
| Engineering | 440 | 313 | -29% | 305 | 426 |

Source: eThekweni Municipality. 2022. *Medium Term Revenue and Expenditure Framework 2022/23 to 2024/25*. Available online. http://www.durban.gov.za/Resource_Centre/reports/Budget/Documents/2022-2023b.pdf Pages 155, 156, 314-318 of 334

[END]